

Policy Brief

Blended Learning: Practices, Challenges and Possibilities in Cambodia Secondary Resource Schools

Chea Phal, Chhim Rithyvong, Ob Bunnath, and Hak Makara

Corresponding author: Seang Linda, Email: lindaseang999@gmail.com

Introduction

The Covid-19 pandemic has created educational disruption around the world, by forcing schools to close their doors to curb the widespread of the virus. At its peak in April 2020, it is estimated that more than 1.6 billion students worldwide were locked out of their schools (Dita Nugrohoi et al. 2020). To keep learning going on, schools had no choice but to swiftly switch from the traditional physical classroom to new forms of remote teaching and learning modalities such as paper-based worksheets, broadcast media through TV and radio, mobile phone, and digital online platforms (UNESCO et al. 2021). Some countries have attempted to reopen their school system only to see it being disrupted again and again by another wave of outbreaks. On March 16, 2020, the Government of Cambodia decided to close all learning institutes, including public and private schools as preventive measures in response to the increase of Covid-19 infected cases. Although all schools were reopened to start the new academic year this January 2021, the 20 February incident has forced the government to close schools nationwide and move to distance learning again. A joint Covid-19 assessment in Cambodia conducted by MoEYS in collaboration with development partners in 2020 found that only 70% of students engaged in some form of alternative distance learning and only 35% of them had access to online learning materials (MoEYS and ESWP 2021). With the pandemic still widely ranging and getting severer in Cambodia, the hope of going back to the "old standards" is shrinking and the imperative of the "new normal" becomes more and more obvious.

In the 2000s when the internet is widely accessible, online learning, along with other forms of distance learning, has been integrated into or supplemented to the traditional classroom, mostly in developed countries. The partial integration of online learning to the physical classroom with some element of student control over the learning process is called blended learning (Horn and Staker 2015; Graham 2012). Blended learning is found to be effective to help underperformed students improve their learning

or provide more options for small and remote schools that cannot offer courses with highly qualified teachers in certain subjects. Although the Covid-19 outbreak has brought many challenges in education, it has helped accelerate online learning rapidly and blended learning has become a buzzword among researchers and practitioners in the field of education. Online learning is expected to forever change the way students learns and that online learning and teaching. It is likely to remain as a part of classroom learning, blending with the traditional mortar-and-brink learning even after the pandemic.

Rationale

There are also many challenges in implementing or integrating online learning effectively, especially in developing countries like Cambodia (MoEYS and ESWP 2021, World Bank 2021). Some key challenges in delivering distance learning during the Covid-19 pandemic include teacher and student unreadiness to adopt new technologies, lack of needed digital devices, limited institutional capacity to support teachers, and poor access to the internet in rural and remote areas. However, Online learning can provide new opportunities and flexibilities that be can be personalized to student needs and levels. Yet, the Covid-19 pandemic came when most education systems and teachers were not ready to reap its benefits (Schleicher, 2021). The evidence on the effectiveness of online learning is still nascent in the context of developing countries, but it is clear that the mere supply of online learning is not sufficient to induce take-up, student engagement, and effective learning. Understanding online learning and teaching practices on the ground during the pandemic and the level of teacher technological readiness can be indispensable inputs for future policy discussion on how to make education systems more resilient against future shocks and uncertainties. In this sense, this study intends to examine the current practices, challenges and possibilities of online learning that can contribute to building back a more resilient education system in Cambodia.

Online Teaching During the Covid-19 Pandemic

Nearly all (94.47 percent) of the interviewed teachers have experienced teaching online after the school closure in March 2020. Among those who were teaching at the time of interviews, about one-third (33.4 percent) of them have completely switched back to physical classroom, 59.9 percent still taught online 100 percent and another 6.7 percent used both online and traditional off-line approach in their teaching. The degree of switching back to complete off-line teaching greatly varies from school to school. While virtually all teachers at some schools have completely returned to physical classrooms, all teachers at some schools still continued teaching. It is worth pointing out that in November 2021, MoEYS allowed grades 9 and 12 to resume physical classrooms so that students can prepare for their examinations. On the same day the data collection was started (November 01, 2021), MoEYS expanded the school reopen to all grades from primary to upper secondary education. female teachers and teachers at general schools

in rural areas have a higher rate of staying teaching online without returning back to physical classrooms or combining online and offline teaching approaches. While nearly half of the teachers in urban areas have returned to off-line classrooms (either completely or partly), more than 70 percent of teachers in rural areas still continued using online teaching as the only option to deliver their teaching.

Teacher Capacity Development During the Pandemic

Nearly 80 percent of the sampled teachers participated in some sort of capacity development activities after the school closure in March 2020. To put it in other words, over one-fourth of teachers (22.4 percent) did not join any capacity development program during the school closure, among various capacity development activities, attending training courses or workshops (57.2 percent) is the most common activity, followed by attending education conferences or seminars (26.6 percent) and conducting individual or collaborative research (21.7 percent). Some teachers also took part in professional networking, mentoring and peer observation activities, yet they are less common activities undertaken by Cambodian teachers, at least during the school closure. Male teachers and teachers in urban schools at resources schools are more active or have more opportunities in joining capacity building activities. While the share of teachers attending training courses at general schools is at 41.7 percent, the share at resource schools is at 64.4 percent. Male teachers are more likely to join training courses and conduct individual or collaborative research than female teachers. Similar patterns are found between teachers in urban and rural schools.

Nearly two years after the school closure, most secondary school teachers thought they don't have adequate capacity for conducting effective online teaching, as nearly 90 percent of those who took part in capacity development activities claimed that training courses they received were not sufficient for them and indicated desire to receive more capacity development programs in the future. Female teachers in rural schools are in higher need of more capacity building activities. Interestingly, teachers at resource schools also showed more interest in having additional training than teachers in general schools, although they had more opportunities to join training programs during the school closure.

Factors Influencing Teacher Readiness for Online Teaching

The regression results show that individual characteristics that have influences on teacher readiness for online teaching include gender, age, perceived challenge in conducting online learning and perceived effectiveness of online learning. Male teachers are very likely to be more ready to effectively use technology in their classroom teaching as they have higher scores of Technological Pedagogical Content Knowledge (TPACK) and the other four outcomes of interest. Holding other factors constant, the TPACK score of male teachers is 0.230 higher than their female teaching peers. Age is also consistently found to be negatively associated with teacher readiness. This means that the older teachers become, the

more difficult it is for them to adopt educational technologies in all estimation. One-year increase in age reduces the TPACK score by 0.011 and the association is statistically significant at 1% level. Teacher perception on challenges in conducting online teaching is positively correlated with teacher readiness. Its effect is in particular large on the technological knowledge (TK) component. To put it in other words, those who think it is challenging to conduct online classrooms are likely to possess low general knowledge and skills on technology. Another noticeable factor is teacher perception of the effectiveness of online teaching. It is positively correlated with all components, except TK. However, the study does not detect any significant relationship between the level of education and teacher readiness for online teaching.

Two factors related to access to technology, use of computers and hours of internet uses for teaching purposes in the past seven days, were added in the estimation models. Teachers who used computers in the last seven days seems to demonstrate a higher level of readiness and its relationships are statistically significant between 5% and 10% levels. However, the correlations between duration teachers spent on the internet and teacher readiness are statistically insignificant in all five models.

Another interest of the study is to investigate school factors that influence teacher readiness. Location, type and size of school are found to affect teacher readiness for online classrooms. In comparison to their provincial peers, teachers working at schools in Phnom Penh have higher scores of TPACK by 0.209 and this factor also positively correlated with TCK and overall scores. Another surprising finding is that teachers at resource schools tend to be less ready than teachers at general schools. In addition, school facilities seem to have no effect on teacher readiness as well. Our teacher survey also reveals that a good proportion of teachers have access to computers and other ICT facilities at their schools, but they do not use it. A majority of teachers mainly used smartphones, instead of computers, for online teaching. The size of schools measured by the number of teachers is found to have negative effects on TPACK and overall score, but not the other three outcomes of interest.

Implication

Findings from the study suggest that virtually all teachers at secondary school have experience teaching online during the school closure, although lesson delivery approach can vary. However, soon after the MoEYS announced school reopening a large number of teachers completely shifted back to off-line teaching and learning and very few teachers combine both online and off-line teaching approaches. Coupled with the insufficient materials for online teaching, the fact that a majority of teachers deliver their online teaching through smartphones due to limited access to computer and technology knowledge suggest that online classrooms are less interactive and of lower quality. In the three knowledge domains,

¹ We asked teachers to rate online effectiveness from 0 to 100.

Cambodian teachers relatively score the lowest in technological knowledge and the highest in pedagogical knowledge. At individual levels, factors that are found to have influenced teacher readiness include gender, age, perceived challenge, and perceived effectiveness of online classroom. Teaching experience at private school and student-teachers interaction are also found to have positive effects on readiness, while teacher education and training seems to be rather ineffective in preparing teachers for online classrooms. Having access to computer can improve teacher readiness, yet it seems teachers do not benefit from school facilities. It is also reflected by the fact that a large proportion of teachers have access to school computers and other facilities but they did not use it. Teachers in Phnom Penh are more prepared for virtual classrooms, while teachers at resource schools are less ready to embrace technology in their teaching.

- Nearly all teachers reported that their initial teacher training programs did not well equip them with sufficient skills and knowledge for online teaching and also need more in-service training programs to do so. In this sense, there is a need to revisit teacher training curricula and examine if more EdTech courses should be introduced in the programs as well as to provide systematic in-set training courses on EdTech for active teachers. Female and older teachers also deserve extra support as they exhibit a lower level of readiness.
- With the current trends (at the time of the survey), online learning is unlikely to stay after the pandemic and a majority of schools and teachers will return to the physical classroom as normal. Considering the benefits and potential of online learning and uncertainties in the future, MoEYS should make extra efforts to keep the online approach as a part of learning and teaching, at least at schools with adequate resources. If used effectively, online learning can supplement traditional physical learning and teaching to enhance educational quality and reduce inequality.
- A large majority of teachers had access to school computers and other digital devices but did not use them. There should be a further investigation on the reasons behind the underutilization of the school resources and how these resources can be effectively put into use.

References

- Abadie, Alberto, Susan Athey, Guido W. Imbens, and Jeffrey Wooldridge. 2017. "When Should You Adjust Standard Errors for Clustering?," November. https://doi.org/10.3386/W24003.
- Alper, A. 2020. "K-12 Distance Education in the Pandemic Process: A Case Study." *Milli Egitim* 49 (1): 45–67.
- Ardiç, Mehmet Alper. 2021. "Examination of Turkish Mathematics Teachers Technology Integration Levels and Their Self-Confidence in TPACK." *Malaysian Online Journal of Educational Technology* 9 (4): 31–49. https://doi.org/10.52380/mojet.2021.9.4.253.
- Atmacasoy, Abdullah, and Meral Aksu. 2018. "Blended Learning at Pre-Service Teacher Education in Turkey: A Systematic Review." *Education and Information Technologies* 23 (6): 2399–2422. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1007/s10639-018-9723-5.
- Azhari, Budi, and Iwan Fajri. 2021. "Distance Learning during the COVID-19 Pandemic: School Closure in Indonesia." *International Journal of Mathematical Education in Science and Technology*. https://doi.org/10.1080/0020739X.2021.1875072/SUPPL_FILE/TMES_A_1875072_SM9011. DOCX.
- Bolliger, Doris U., Craig E. Shepherd, and H. Victoria Bryant. 2019. "Faculty Members' Perceptions of Online Program Community and Their Efforts to Sustain It." *British Journal of Educational Technology* 50 (6): 3283–99. https://doi.org/10.1111/BJET.12734.
- Boonsue, Worasiri. 2021. "Factors Influencing the Technological Pedagogical Content Knowledge (TPACK) of English Teachers in Primary Schools, Chiang Mai Primary Educational Service Area 1." *Turkish Journal of Computer and Mathematics Education (TURCOMAT)* 12 (8): 2983–90. https://doi.org/10.17762/TURCOMAT.V12I8.4132.
- Cavas, Bulent, Pinar Cavas, Bahar Karaoglan, and Tarik Kisla. 2009. "A Study on Science Teachers' Attitudes Toward Information and Communication Technologies in Education." *The Turkish Online Journal of Educational Technology* 8: 1303–6521.
- Dewi, Novi Ratna, Ani Rusilowati, Sigit Saptono, Sri Haryani, Wiyanto Wiyanto, Saiful Ridlo, and Prasetyo Listiaji. 2021. "View of Technological, Pedagogical, Content Knowledge (TPACK) Research Trends: A Systematic Literature Review Publish Between 2010-2020." *Journal of Turkish Science Education*. https://www.tused.org/index.php/tused/article/view/1354/712.
- Dita Nugrohoi, Chiara Pasquinii, Nicolas Reugeii, and Diogo Amaro. 2020. "COVID-19: How Are Countries Preparing to Mitigate the Learning Loss as Schools Reopen? Trends and Emerging Good Practices to Support the Most Vulnerable Children." https://en.unesco.org/covid19/educationresponse.
- Dolighan, Tim, and Michael Owen. 2021. "Teacher Efficacy for Online Teaching during the COVID-19 Pandemic." *Brock Education Journal* 30 (1): 95–116. https://files.eric.ed.gov/fulltext/EJ1289256.pdf.
- Dorsah, Philip. 2021. "Pre-Service Teachers' Readiness for Emergency Remote Learning in the Wake of COVID-19." *European Journal of STEM Education* 6 (1): 01. https://doi.org/10.20897/ejsteme/9557.

- Fahadi, Mugigayi, and Md. Shahadat Hossian Khan. 2022. "Technology-Enhanced Teaching in Engineering Education: Teachers' Knowledge Construction Using TPACK Framework." *International Journal of Instruction* 15 (2): 519–42.
- Graham, Charles R. 2012. "Blended Learning Systems: Definition, Current Trends, and Future Directions." In *The Handbook of Blended Learning: Global Perspectives, Local Designs*, edited by Curtis J. Bonk and Charles R. Graham. San Francisco, CA: Pfeiffer Publishing.
- Heng, Kimkong, and Koemhong Sol. 2020. "Online Learning During COVID-19: Key Challenges and Suggestions to Enhance Effectiveness." Cambodian Journal of Educational Research .

 December 2020. https://cefcambodia.com/2020/12/08/online-learning-during-covid-19-key-challenges-and-suggestions-to-enhance-effectiveness/.
- Horn, Michael B, and Heather Staker. 2015. *Blended: Using Disruptive Innovation to Improve Schools*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.
- Hsu, Liwei, and Yen Jung Chen. 2021. "Hierarchical Linear Modeling to Explore Contextual Effects on EFL Teachers' Technology, Pedagogy, and Content Knowledge (TPACK): The Taiwanese Case." *The Asia-Pacific Education Researcher* 2021, October, 1–13. https://doi.org/10.1007/S40299-021-00626-1.
- Jang, Syh-Jong, and Meng-Fang Tsai. 2013. "Exploring the TPACK of Taiwanese Secondary School Science Teachers Using a New Contextualized TPACK Model." *Australasian Journal of Educational Technology* 29 (4): 566–80. https://doi.org/10.14742/AJET.282.
- Junus, Kasiyah, Harry Budi Santoso, Panca Oktavia Hadi Putra, Arfive Gandhi, and Titin Siswantining. 2021. "Lecturer Readiness for Online Classes during the Pandemic: A Survey Research." *Education Sciences* 11 (3): 139. https://doi.org/10.3390/EDUCSCI11030139.
- Khlaif, Zuheir N, and Soheil Salha. 2020. "The Unanticipated Educational Challenges of Developing Countries in Covid-19 Crisis: A Brief Report." *Interdisciplinary Journal of Virtual Learning in Medical Sciences* 11 (2): 130–34. https://doi.org/10.30476/IJVLMS.2020.86119.1034.
- Khlaif, Zuheir N., Soheil Salha, Saida Affouneh, Hadi Rashed, and Lotfia Ali ElKimishy. 2021. "The Covid-19 Epidemic: Teachers' Responses to School Closure in Developing Countries." *Technology, Pedagogy and Education* 30 (1): 95–109. https://doi.org/10.1080/1475939X.2020.1851752.
- Koehler, Matthew, and Punya Mishra. 2009. "What Is Technological Pedagogical Content Knowledge?" *Contemporary Issues in Technology and Teacher Education* 9 (1): 60–70. https://citejournal.org/volume-9/issue-1-09/general/what-is-technological-pedagogicalcontent-knowledge/.
- Koh, Joyce, Hwee L, Ching S. C, and Ching-Chung T. 2014. "Demographic Factors, TPACK Constructs, and Teachers' Perceptions of Constructivist-Oriented TPACK." *Educational Technology & Society* 17 (1): 185–96. https://www.jstor.org/stable/pdf/jeductechsoci.17.1.185.pdf.
- Kuzminska, Olena, Nataliia Morze, Mariia Mazorchuk, Olha Barna, and Viktoriia Dobriak. 2021. "How to Balance Synchronous and Asynchronous Teaching and Learning: A Local Study." 2021. https://doi.org/10.34916/el.2021.13.05.

- Lase, Delipiter, Trisa Genia Chrisantiana Zega, Dorkas Orienti Daeli, and Sonny Eli Zaluchu. 2022. "Parents' Perceptions of Distance Learning During COVID-19 in Rural Indonesia." *Journal of Education and Learning (EduLearn)* 16 (1): 103–13.
- Mahmud, Rosnaini, and Mohd Arif Ismail. 2010. "Impact of Training and Experience in Using ICT on In-Service Teachers' Basic ICT Literacy." *Malaysian Journal of Educational Technology* 10 (2): 5–10.
- Martin, Florence, Chuang Wang, Annika Jokiaho, Birgit May, and Sonja Grübmeyer. 2019. "Examining Faculty Readiness to Teach Online: A Comparison of US and German Educators." *European Journal of Open, Distance and e-Learning* 22 (1): 54. https://www.uncc.edu],.
- Mishra, Punya, and Matthew J. Koehler. 2006. "Technological Pedagogical Content Knowledge: A Framework for Teacher Knowledge." *Teachers College Record* 108 (6): 1017–54.
- Mncube, Vusi, Emmanuel Olawale, and Winston Hendricks. 2019. "Exploring Teachers' Readiness for E-Learning: On Par with the Fourth Industrial Revolution?" *International Journal of Knowledge, Innovation and Entrepreneurship* 7 (2): 5–20.
- MoEYS, and ESWP. 2021. "The Cambodia COVID-19 Joint Education Needs Assessment." Phnom Penh.
- Muñoz Carril, Pablo César, Mercedes González Sanmamed, and Nuria Hernández Sellés. 2013. "Pedagogical Roles and Competencies of University Teachers Practicing in the E-Learning Environment." *The International Review of Research in Open and Distributed Learning* 14 (3): 462–87. https://doi.org/10.19173/irrodl.v14i3.1477.
- Mwapwele, Samuel Dick, Mario Marais, Sifiso Dlamini, and Judy van Biljon. 2019. "Teachers' ICT Adoption in South African Rural Schools: A Study of Technology Readiness and Implications for the South Africa Connect Broadband Policy." *The African Journal of Information and Communication*, no. 24 (December): 1–21. https://doi.org/10.23962/10539/28658.
- Nikolopoulou, Kleopatra, Vasilis Gialamas, Konstantinos Lavidas, and Vassilis Komis. 2021. "Teachers' Readiness to Adopt Mobile Learning in Classrooms: A Study in Greece." *Technology, Knowledge and Learning* 26 (1): 53–77. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10758-020-09453-7.
- Ogbonnaya, Ugorji I., Florence C. Awoniyi, and Mogalatjane E. Matabane. 2020. "Move to Online Learning during COVID-19 Lockdown: Pre-Service Teachers' Experiences in Ghana." *International Journal of Learning, Teaching and Educational Research* 19 (10): 286–303. https://doi.org/10.26803/ijlter.19.10.16.
- Özgür, Hasan. 2020. "Relationships Between Teachers' Technostress, Technological Pedagogical Content Knowledge (TPACK), School Support and Demographic Variables: A Structural Equation Modeling." *Computers in Human Behavior* 112 (November): 106468. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.chb.2020.106468.
- Panol, Rowena F, Dennis G Caballes, and Ariston G Vasquez. 2020. "Teachers' Readiness Level on Online Teaching: Embracing Distance Learning Modality." *CiiT International Journal of Software Engineering and Technology* 12 (4).
- Sahni, S. D, J. R Polanin, Q Zhang, L. E Michealson, S Caverly, M. L Polese, and L. Yang. 2021. "Why This Study? A What Works Clearinghouse Rapid Evidence Review of Distance Learning Programs."

- Scherer, Ronny, Sarah K. Howard, Jo Tondeur, and Fazilat Siddiq. 2021. "Profiling Teachers' Readiness for Online Teaching and Learning in Higher Education: Who's Ready?" *Computers in Human Behavior* 118 (May): 106675. https://doi.org/10.1016/J.CHB.2020.106675.
- Schleicher, Andreas. 2021. "The Impact of Covid-19 on Education Insights: From Education at a Glance 2020." Paris.
- Schmid, Mirjam, Eliana Brianza, and Dominik Petko. 2020. "Developing a Short Assessment Instrument for Technological Pedagogical Content Knowledge (TPACK.Xs) and Comparing the Factor Structure of an Integrative and a Transformative Model." *Computers & Education* 157 (November): 103967. https://doi.org/10.1016/J.COMPEDU.2020.103967.
- Setiadi, P. M., D. Alia, S. Sumardi, R. Respati, and L. Nur. 2021. "Synchronous or Asynchronous? Various Online Learning Platforms Studied in Indonesia 2015-2020." *Journal of Physics: Conference Series* 1987 (1): 012016. https://doi.org/10.1088/1742-6596/1987/1/012016.
- Shea, Peter. 2019. "Bridges and Barriers to Teaching Online College Courses: A Study of Experienced Online Faculty in Thirty-Six Colleges." *Journal of Asynchronous Learning Networks* 11 (2): 73–128. https://doi.org/10.24059/OLJ.V11I2.1728.
- Shi, Yafei, Mingwen Tong, and Taotao Long. 2021. "Investigating Relationships among Blended Synchronous Learning Environments, Students' Motivation, and Cognitive Engagement: A Mixed Methods Study." *Computers & Education* 168 (July): 104193. https://doi.org/10.1016/J.COMPEDU.2021.104193.
- Shulman, Lee. 1987. "Knowledge and Teaching: Foundations of the New Reform." *Harvard Educational Review* 57 (1): 1–23. https://doi.org/10.17763/HAER.57.1.J463W79R56455411.
- So, Hyo Jeong, Hyungshin Choi, Wei Ying Lim, and Yao Xiong. 2012. "Little Experience with ICT: Are They Really the Next Generation Student-Teachers?" *Computers and Education* 59 (4): 1234–45. https://doi.org/10.1016/J.COMPEDU.2012.05.008.
- Summak, M. Semih, Murat Bağlibel, and Mustafa Samancioğlu. 2010. "Technology Readiness of Primary School Teachers: A Case Study in Turkey." In *Procedia Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 2:2671–75. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sbspro.2010.03.393.
- UNESCO, UNICEF, World Bank, and OECD. 2020. "What's Next? Lessons on Education Recovery: Findings from a Survey of Ministries of Education amid the COVID-19 Pandemic." Paris, New York, Washington D.C. http://www.unesco.org/open-access/terms-use-ccbysa-en.
- Ventayen, Randy Joy M. 2018. "Teachers' Readiness in Online Teaching Environment: A Case of Department of Education Teachers." *Journal of Education, Management and Social Sciences* 2 (1): 94–106.
- World Bank. 2021. "Cambodia Economic Update: Living with Covid: The Impact of the Covid-19 Pandemic." Phnom Penh: World Bank Group.